

Princeton University

**AMERICAN MEDICINE: INSTITUTIONAL AND HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES ON
CURRENT ISSUES**

Sociology 363 Fall 1999 T,Th 11am McCosh 64, plus precept

Donald W. Light, Visiting Professor
Department of Sociology
dlight@Princeton.edu Green Hall 2-C-16 258-
Office Hours: to be set

American health care has rapidly changed in ways that disturb both physicians and patients alike. The corporatization of services seems inevitable and necessary though it is neither. It is undergoing a transformation in the name of efficiency and cost containment that uses few of the proven techniques that other advanced systems have used, and actually positions the major players for long-term growth. How did the current system come to pass, and what are the forces that shape it?

This course provides a coherent historical and sociological account of the current system in which we will work and live. It offers a foundation for addressing ethical and policy issues. All readings are required and will be the basis, together with material from classes, of grading. Since the class and discussion are important parts of the learning experience, attendance is required and will be taken. Excused absences are always possible.

Critical Discourse

People learn best if they are participating. Although I personally love good lectures, of various pedagogical methods, lectures have been shown to produce the least understanding and retention. Therefore, to the extent possible, I will try to lead a critical discourse in the main classes as well as the precepts. The problem will be the ratio between the number of people and "air time," and we'll all learn how to handle that together.

The most enduring things that you can go away with are the abilities to think critically, be articulate, and write lucidly. Critical discourse will require us all to be succinct. I will do what I can to help you improve these lifelong skills. If you can do all three well already, then see if you can do them even better.

The other key habit or skill is to base your views on facts and the readings. Policy is full of assertions and convictions without substance. The success of critical discourse depends on your reading all the materials for the week **before** each Tuesday. (Why

not? You have to read them anyway, and you'll get so much more out the classes if you do.)

Class attendance and arriving on time are required (see Announcement pp. 36-37) to make this kind of class work.

Dialogue with the Authors

More insight and enjoyment can come from getting to know some of the most distinguished observers and participants in the health care scene. I have therefore chosen a limited number of works by some of the best in the land. Four of them have been persuaded to come to class so that you can meet them personally and talk with them. They are

Stephen Schroeder, M.D., President, The Robert Wood Johnson Foundation

Gina Kolata, feature health writer, *The New York Times*

Uwe Reinhardt, distinguished health economist, Princeton University

Gail Shearer, Director of Health Policy Analysis, Consumers Union, Washington D.C.

Readings

All readings are required. All readings are on 3-hour reserve.

Three of the books are on sale at Micawber Bookstore. Ask at the desk for them:

The Social Transformation of American Medicine -- Starr

The Managed Care Blues and How to Cure Them -- Zelman & Berenson

Purchasing Population Health -- Kindig

Two other long reports will be available from me:

Strangled Competition II (Managed Competition in the Minneapolis Market)

Hidden from View (empoverishment through uncovered medical bills)

A Bulk Pack of the articles is for sale at Pequod.

Grading

As the Undergraduate Announcement states, A's are for excellent work. Nobody "deserves" an A, even if you are an "A student."

B's are for solid, good work, and for flawed A work (i.e. great idea but not developed, or a well-read "argument" that goes nowhere. Ask yourself, "What point(s) am I trying to make?" "And...? So what?")

C's are for just average work, D's for poor, ill-prepared work, and F's for failing work.

Weighting will be:

Take-home midterm essays	25%
Take-home final essays	25%
Research paper	40%
Class participation	10%

Late hand-ins will lose a third of a grade per day (e.g. from a B+ to B, etc.)

Exams and Research Paper

There will be two sets of take-home essays. You are on your honor to prepare for them and answer them on your own. Take-home essays, in the spirit of the course, encourage reflection and succinct thought, because the page limits will be short.

The research term paper can be done in pairs or alone. If in pairs, both students will get the same grade; so be sure both of you pull your weight. Papers should be about 15 pages of double-spaced, typed text for one author, and about 25 pages for two.

The research paper should consider the following:

- What is the thesis or true subject of your investigation and paper?
- History matters. How did it develop and how are past decisions, patterns, or institutions reflected in the issue?
- What trends are at play?
- Who are the major stakeholders and others affected, and how?
- Institutions, money and power matter. Besides stakeholders, how do they frame the whole issue?
- Ideas and ideology matter. What are the major assumptions being made, convictions held, and goals asserted?
- Facts, trends, and experiences matter. How do they square with the assumptions, convictions and goals?

Research Proposal. DUE Nov. 9th in class. 1-3 pages. Outline the problem, why you chose it, what research materials and methods you plan to use, and what problems (if any) concern you.

Paper Due December 14th in class.

Evaluation Criteria

- Coverage of topic
- Quality of research
- Quality of your analysis/insights

Interest/significance of the topic and your approach to it

Good Organization

Clarity of the writing

Grammar/syntax

Solid referencing

Socio. 363 American Medicine: Institutional and Historical Perspectives

PART I: PROFESSIONAL DOMINANCE AND ITS IRONIES

Week 1 (Sept 21) Origins of Professional Dominance

Paul Starr, *The Social Transformation of American Medicine* pp.79-179.

Donald W. Light, "Comparative Models of 'Health Care' Systems.' In P. Conrad and R.Kern, eds., *The Sociology of Health and Illness* pp. 455-470.

Week 2 (Sept 28) Creating a Protected Market

Paul Starr, *The Social Transformation of American Medicine* pp.180-234.

Week 3 (Oct 5) Insurance without Interference

Paul Starr, *The Social Transformation of American Medicine* pp.235-334.

Carl Malmberg, *140 Million Patients*. New York: Reynal & Hitchcock, 1947: Ch. 1,2, 4,5.

Week 4 (Oct 12) The Golden Age of Medicine and Its Ironies

Paul Starr, *The Social Transformation of American Medicine* pp.335-378.

Barbara and John Ehrenreich, "The Medical-Industrial Complex." *Health PAC Bulletin* 1969:1-10.

Illich, Ivan, *Medical Nemesis: The Expropriation of Health*. 1975;(various printings): Ch. 1,2, 6,8.

Week 5 (Oct 19) Legitimation Crisis and the Buyers' Revolt

Paul Starr, *The Social Transformation of American Medicine* pp.379-449.

Donald W. Light, "Countervailing Power: The Changing Character of the Medical Profession in the United States." In F. Hafferty and J. McKinlay, eds. *The Changing Character of the Medical Profession: An International Perspective* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993)pp. 69-79.

Donald W. Light, "The Restructuring of the American Health Care System." In TJ Litman and LS Robins, eds., *Health Politics and Policy* 3rd Ed (Albany: Delmar, 1997): 46-63.

Week 6 (Oct 26) Review and Midterm

FALL BREAK

**PART II:
THE UNHARNESSED TROIKA AND THE LURCHING HEALTH CARE SLEIGH**

Week 7 (Nov 9) The 1980s: Revolution with few Results

Robert H. Miller and Harold S. Luft, "Managed Care Plan Performance Since 1980: A Literature Analysis." *Journal of the American Medical Association* 1994;271:1512-19.

Robert H. Miller and Harold S. Luft, "Does Managed Care Lead to Better or Worse Quality of Care?" *Health Affairs* 1997;16(5):7-25.

Kip Sullivan, "Managed Care Plan Performance Since 1980: Another Look at 2 Literature Reviews." *American Journal of Public Health* 1999;89:1003-8.

Steven A. Schroeder and Lewis G. Sandy, "Specialty Distribution of U.S. Physicians – the Inevitable Driver of Health Care Costs." *NEJM* 1993;328:961-3.

Kenneth E. Thorpe, "Health Care Cost Containment: Results and Lessons from the Past 20 Years." In Stephen M. Shortell and Uwe E. Reinhardt, eds. *Improving Health Policy and Management* (Health Administration Press, 1992), pp. 227-274.

Walter A. Zelman & Robert A Berenson, *The Managed Care Blues & How to Cure Them*. (Washington DC: Georgetown University Press, 1998): Ch. 4-9.

Week 8 (Nov 16) Voluntary Health Insurance – Institutional Effects on Costs, Access, Equity

Donald W. Light, "The Practice and Ethics of Risk-Rated Health Insurance." *Journal of the American Medical Association* 1992;267: 2503-8.

G. Silberman et al. "Availability and Appropriateness of Allogenic Bone Marrow Transplantation for Chronic Myeloid Leukemia in 10 Countries." *NEJM* 1994;331:1063-67.

W.P. Peters and M.C. Rogers, "Variations in Approval by Insurance Companies of Coverage for Autologous Bone Marrow Transplantation for Breast Cancer." *New England Journal of Medicine* 1994;330: 473-7.

S.D. Boren, "I Had a Tough Day Today, Hillary." *New England Journal of Medicine* 1994;330: 500-2.

Donald W. Light, Life, Death and the Insurance Companies," *New England Journal of Medicine* 1994;330: 498-500.

M.E.Rasell, "Cost Sharing in Health Insurance – A Reexamination." *New England Journal of Medicine* 1995;332: 1164-68.

Steven A. Schroeder, "The Medically Uninsured – Will They Always Be With Us? *New England Journal of Medicine* 1996;334:1130-33.

Gail Shearer, *Hidden From View: The Growing Burden of Health Care Costs* (Washington DC: Consumers Union, 1998).

Humphrey Taylor and Uwe Reinhardt, "Does the System Fit?" *Health Management Quarterly* 1991;XIII (3):2-10.

Uwe E. Reinhardt, "A Social Contract for 21st Century Health Care: Three-tier Health Care with Bounty Hunting." *Health Economics* 1996;5(6):479-99.

Uwe E. Reinhardt, "Wanted: A Clearly Articulated Social Ethic for American Health Care." *JAMA* 1997;278:1446-7.

Kevin Grumbach, "National Health Insurance in America – Can We Practice With It? Can We Continue to Practice Without It?" *Western Journal of Medicine* 1989;151:210-6.

Week 9 (Nov 23) Competition – Economic Theory vs Medical & Market Realities

Robert G. Evans, "Tension, Compression and Shear: Directions, Stresses, and Outcomes of Health Care Cost Control." *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law* 1990;15:101-28.

Robert G. Evans, "Going for the Gold." *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law* 1997;22:427-66.

Uwe E. Reinhardt, "Reorganizing the Financial Flows in American Health Care." *Health Affairs* 1993;12(suppl): 172-93.

Uwe E. Reinhardt, "Economics." *JAMA* 1996;275(23):

Peter MacPherson, "Is This Where We Want to Go?" *Hastings Center Report* 1997 (Nov): 17-22.

Steven A. Schroeder, "Cost Containment in US Health Care." *Academic Medicine* 1995;70:861-6.

Robert Evans, Alan Maynard, Alexander Preker, Uwe Reinhardt, "Health Care Reform" *Health Economics* 1994;3:339.

Gerard F. Anderson, "In Search of Value: An International Comparison of Cost, Access, and Outcomes." *Health Affairs* 1997;16(6):163-171.

Donald W. Light, "From Managed Competition to Managed Cooperation." *The Health Summary* 1997 (Nov): 4-6.

Minnesota COACT, *Strangled Competition: A Critique of Minnesota's Experiment with Managed Competition* (St Paul 1993): 1-6.

Robert O. Morgan et al., "The Medicare-HMO Revolving Door – The Healthy Go In and the Sick Go Out." *NEJM* 1997;337(3): 169-75.

Susan Reed, "Miss Treatment." *New Republic* 1997 (Dec 29): 20-2.

Kenneth B. Wells, et al., "Detection of Depressive Disorder for Patients Receiving Prepaid or Fee-for-Service Care." *NEJM* 1989;262(23):3298-3302.

Mark Schlesinger and David Mechanic, "Challenges for Managed Competition From Chronic Illness." *Health Affairs* 1993 (Supple):123-37.

Week 10 (Nov 30) Corporate Managed Care

Lynn Etheredge, Stanley Jones and Lawrence Lewin, "What is Driving Health System Change?" *Health Affairs* 1996;15(4):45-56.

Jon Gabel, "Ten Ways HMOs Have Changed During the 1990s." *Health Affairs* 1997;16(3): 134-45.

Uwe Reinhardt, "Health System Change: Skirmish or Revolution?" *Health Affairs* 1996;15(4):57-8.

(quality set:)

Jack Zwanziger & Glenn Melnick, "Can Managed Care Plans Control Health Care Costs?" *Health Affairs* 1996 (Sum): 185-99.

Minnesota COACT, *Strangled Competition II: The Quality of Health Care Under Managed Competition* (St Paul 1997): Parts 1-3.

David Himmelstein et al. "Quality of Care in Investor-owned vs Not-for-Profit HMOs." *JAMA* 1999;282:159-63.

Jan Fisher, "Families Providing Complex Medical Care, Tubes and All." *New York Times* 1998 (Jun 7): 1, 30.

Uwe E. Reinhardt, "Quality – the Achilles Heel of Market Strategy." *Hospitals* 1988;62(19): 24.

Kurt Eichenwald and Gina Kolata, "Drug Trials Hide Conflicts for Doctors." *New York Times* 1999 (May 16): 1,34-5.

Paul Ellwood 1999

Week 11-12 (Dec 7) Purchasing for Outcomes and Health

David A. Kindig, *Purchasing Population Health* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1997).

Mikko Vienonen, Danguole Jankauskiene and Arvi Vask, "Towards Evidence-Based Health Care Reform." *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 1999;77(1):44-7.

"The Ljubljana Charter on Reforming Health Care." *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 1999;77(1):48-9.

Reading Period Jan 3-11

Exam Period Jan 12-22